



County Hall
Cardiff
CF10 4UW
Tel: (029) 2087 2000

Neuadd y Sir
Caerdydd
CF10 4UW
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2000

AGENDA

Committee	ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE
Date and Time of Meeting	TUESDAY, 15 SEPTEMBER 2020, 4.30 PM
Venue	REMOTE MEETING VIA MS TEAMS
Membership	Councillor Patel (Chair) Councillors Derbyshire, Owen Jones, Lancaster, Jackie Parry, Parkhill, Owen, Sandrey and Wong

1 **Apologies for Absence**

To receive apologies for absence.

2 **Declarations of Interest**

To be made at the start of the agenda item in question, in accordance with the Members' Code of Conduct.

3 **Minutes** (*Pages 3 - 8*)

To approve as a correct record the minutes of the meeting held on 3 March 2020.

4 **Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate - Covid Update - Service Areas & Capital Programme** (*Pages 9 - 12*)

To provide the Committee with an opportunity to consider the current position of the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate, and the impact that the current Covid crisis has had upon service delivery and capital projects.

5 **Environmental Scrutiny Committee - Draft Annual Report 2018/19** (*Pages 13 - 60*)

Principal Scrutiny Officer to talk Members through the Environmental Scrutiny Committee – Draft Annual Report. Members will be asked to consider the report, decide if any alterations are required and agree a final format to be presented to Council.

6 Urgent Items (if any)

7 Way Forward

To review the evidence and information gathered during consideration of each agenda item, agree Members comments, observations and concerns to be passed on to the relevant Cabinet Member by the Chair, and to note items for inclusion on the Committee's Forward Work Programme.

8 Date of next meeting

To be confirmed

Davina Fiore

Director Governance & Legal Services

Date: Wednesday, 9 September 2020

Contact: Graham Porter,
02920 873401, g.porter@cardiff.gov.uk

This meeting will be recorded for subsequent broadcast on the Council's website. The whole of the meeting will be recorded, except where there are confidential or exempt items. A copy of the recording will also be retained in accordance with the Council's data retention policy.

If you make a representation to the meeting you will be deemed to have consented to being filmed and/or recorded.

If you have any queries regarding the recording of this meeting, please contact Committee Services on 02920 872020 or email democraticservices@cardiff.gov.uk

ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

3 MARCH 2020

Present: Councillor Patel(Chairperson)
Councillors Derbyshire, Owen Jones, Lancaster, Jackie Parry,
Parkhill, Owen, Wong and Wood

1 : APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

No apologies for absence were received.

2 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

No declarations of interest were received.

3 : MINUTES

The minutes of the meeting held on 17 February 2020 were approved by the Committee as a correct record and were signed by the Chairperson.

4 : QUARTERLY PERFORMANCE MONITORING - QUARTERS 1 & 2, 2019/20

The Committee received a report providing Members with an opportunity to review the performance reports relevant to the terms of reference for the Committee for Quarter 1 (April to June 2019) and Quarter 2 (July to September 2019). Members were asked to note that Waste Management transferred to the People and Communities Directorate in August 2019.

Members were advised that Council agreed the Corporate Plan 2019-22 in February 2019. The Corporate Plan set out the Council's Well-Being objectives, key priorities and key performance indicators. The performance management framework includes the production of a quarterly production of the Delivering Capital Ambition Performance Report 2019-20 for Cabinet. The sections of the performance report relevant to the Committee were referenced in the cover report.

The Chairperson welcomed Councillor Michael Michael, Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling and the Environment; Sarah McGill, Corporate Director; Andrew Gregory, Director and Matt Wakelam, Assistant Director to the meeting. The officers were invited to deliver a presentation on the Q1 and Q2 performance reports.

Members were invited to comment, seek clarification or raise questions on the information received. Those discussions are summarised as follows:

- Members asked for additional information regarding the proposals for active travel plans in schools. Members were advised that the authority is aiming to introduce active travel plans for walking and cycling in all schools. This will require investment in cycling infrastructure, such as cycle racks. New schools will be fully compliant with standards. There will also be links to segregated cycle routes and other cycling provision.

- Members noted that the Welsh Government’s recycling target was unlikely to be met. Members asked what the likely financial penalty would be based on current projections and whether, or not, Welsh Government would enforce it. Officers stated that a recommendation would be given to the Minister by civil servants and the Minister would decide whether to apply the penalty. The Council is working with Welsh Government and WRAP to achieve a 70% recycling rate in the longer term. Welsh Government will form their own view but at the moment the Council is working with Welsh Government and other key partners to attempt to deliver 64% recycling. Members were asked to note that 30% of the city’s housing stock are apartments with no facilities for segregating recycling. In terms of any liabilities, the Council is able to demonstrate it knows why recycling targets are not being achieved. For instance, the impact of trade waste on the recycling target is -1.7%.
- Members asked when the new bus station would be operational. Members also noted that 46.6% of journeys are non-car journeys. Members also asked whether officers were confident the 50/50 modal shift would be achieved. Officers advised that the bus station would be operational mid-2022, subject to contract negotiations. In terms of modal shift, the delivery of fundamental improvements such as cycling superhighways and new bus stations will provide a ‘step change’.
- Members noted that the target for active travel plans in schools was 40%. Members asked how the target was arrived at and whether there are set criteria for acceptable active travel plans for schools, such as the banning of dropping off points directly outside schools. Members also asked whether additional funding has been identified in order to bring existing schools up to standard. The Director stated that this would depend on the nature of the plan brought forward by the schools. There is a degree of individuality. A pilot banned vehicles from the front of the school. If that proves successful then it may be rolled out wider. Funding may be bid for as part of Local Transport Fund bids.
- Members sought to clarify the results for measuring street cleanliness. A Councillor stated that in his ward suffers from nuisance caused by seagulls opening refuse sacks during Q1 Apr – Jun. He was surprised, therefore, that street cleanliness improves in Q1 from Q3. Officers stated that streets are inspected at 3 month, 6 month and 12 month intervals depending on footfall. A number of factors can affect cleanliness including the weather and staff sickness levels.
- Members noted that the number of flytipping reports responded to within timescales is higher in Q1. Officers stated that the percentage represents the number of flytipping incidents cleared or enforced within timescales and it doesn’t represent the actual figure of flytipping incidents reported.
- Officers agreed to provide updated figures regarding the current and projected staff sickness levels within the directorate.
- The Committee supported more ambitious targets for the number of missed collections, perhaps in terms of the total number of households affected or the total tonnage.

- Members asked whether the increase in enforcement actions was as a result of better reporting or due to an increase in violations. The Assistant Director advised that new technology now identifies where waste is presented after waste operatives have visited a street. The staff in the 'pink sticker' team will try to educate and encourage residents to change their behaviour before moving to enforcement action.
- Members asked how much flexibility operatives are permitted to exercise in terms of the application of the 'pink stickers' scheme. A Member recalled an incident whereby their garden waste bin would not be collected because somebody had put a drink can in there. The Assistant Director stated that over 200 staff have been trained. They have been made aware of the passing litter issue. A pink sticker should not be issued in those circumstances. The pink stickers should only be used where there is substantial contamination.
- Members noted that Cardiff was ranked 16th in Wales in terms of food hygiene inspections. The Committee asked how Cardiff compared to Vale of Glamorgan and Bridgend. The Assistant Director stated that Cardiff has considerable higher turnover of new businesses and demand exceeds that of the other authorities. The Cabinet Member stated that there is huge disparity in terms of numbers of food businesses.
- Officers confirmed that business continuity plans will be instigated in the event of a coronavirus outbreak. The plans are being reviewed and discussions are ongoing with union colleagues.

RESOLVED – That the Chairperson writes on behalf of the Committee to the Cabinet Member on behalf of the Committee conveying any comments, observations and recommendations made during the way forward.

5 : CABINET RESPONSE - ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE REPORT TITLED 'LITTER & FLY TIPPING IN CARDIFF'

The Committee undertook a task and finish inquiry entitled 'Litter and Fly Tipping in Cardiff'. The report was presented to Cabinet on 13 June 2019 and a full response was agreed by the Cabinet on 10 October 2019. The Committee received a report on the Cabinet's response to the task and finish inquiry report.

The task and finish report made a series of key findings and a total of 68 recommendations. Of those recommendations 57 were accepted, 10 were partially accepted and one was rejected. The key findings and recommendations were based on 11 themes, details of which were set out in the report.

The Chairperson welcomed Councillor Michael Michael, Cabinet Member for Recycling, Clean Streets and Environment; Sarah McGill, Corporate Director People and Communities; and Matt Wakelam, Assistant Director Street Scene to the meeting.

The Chairperson opened the debate on this item. Members were invited to comment, raise questions or seek clarification on the report. The discussion is summarised as follows:

- Members requested further clarification of plans to introduce a dedicated Enforcement Team. Members were advised that Enforcement Officers are able to enforce a range of issues from the small scale, such as littering and chewing gum to the larger scale such as building waste and companies not having a waste contract in place. The focus would be how to train other officers across service areas to enforce littering fixed penalties in order to get a more holistic approach and to allow Waste Officers more capacity to attend to more serious issues and use the available resources more efficiently. The Enforcement Team would be made up from a combination of existing staff, such as caretakers and housing enforcement officers.
- Officers advised that the service area is working in partnership with the Welsh Government to tackle problem littering from cars and other vehicles. At present, if people litter from vehicles the Council can write to the registered keeper. However, if the registered keeper fails to respond then there is nothing further the authority can do. Officers recognised that littering from cars is a significant issue in Cardiff. Members were asked to note that clearing litter from high speed routes is dangerous and staff who are asked to perform this duty are put at risk. New legislation was introduced in England to address this particular problem. It is anticipated that the Welsh Government will follow suit as discussion papers have been drafted. Members asked whether the Council has made representations in support of the proposal. Officers stated that a letter of support has been sent but it may be time for a more formal representations to be made from by the Leader or Cabinet.
- The Committee welcomed the Cabinet's acceptance of recommendations relating to volunteering. Officers were asked to estimate how long it would take to implement the recommendations. Officers advised that an action plan is being developed and that detail would be included. However, some of the recommendations have already been delivered.
- Officers advised that the authority is seeking to establish an overarching group aimed at supporting smaller, local groups of volunteers. The joint groups would meet quarterly in order to provide a forum to share ideas and discuss best practice. Members were asked to note that the 'love where you live' campaign was not just concerned with litter picking. The Welsh Government has put forward funding for green spaces for which Community Councils can apply. Officers would like to see more businesses involved in the 'love where you live' campaign.
- The Cabinet Member publicly wished to thank the members of the Cardiff Rivers Group and other volunteers for their efforts, particularly in relation to their help in the restoration of Bute Park following the recent flooding. Officers confirmed that a permanent volunteer co-ordinators post will be established.
- Members requested that officers provide further clarity in terms of those recommendations that are partially accepted. The Assistant Director stated that

the Action Plan would provide clarity.

- Members considered that, in terms of reskilling/training, it would be useful if Parks Staff were given enforcement powers to prevent household waste from being dumped in parks bins.
- A Member asked whether more could be done to promote the 'Cardiff App' to existing and new residents in the city. For example, the app could be promoted on the Council Tax letters that are currently being sent to every household. The Assistant Director stated that more facilities are being added to the app and the digital systems to support the app are in place. All data received from the app is pooled and once a problem is reported via the app it will be dealt with.
- Referring to recommendations 27, 28 and 30 – Members suggested whether litter bins could have a QR code on them which could be scanned via the Cardiff app and reported as being full. Officers welcomed the idea. Members also asked whether litter bins in all areas of the city could have separate containers for recyclables.
- Members asked whether temporary recycling facilities in blocks of flats was feasible. The Cabinet Member stated that this has been trailed but it resulted in too much contamination. It was recognised that such temporary facilities need to be provided in managed spaces, such as hubs.
- Members asked whether any progress has been made regarding the proposed move to a rolling 4-day working week; whether there has been any consultation with the unions and whether there is support for the proposal in principal. The Assistant Director advised that a report will be coming forward in the near future regarding the approach to be taken and the report will be presented to the Committee. The Cabinet Member stated that the proposals will be with the agreement of all stakeholders and will modernise the service for the betterment of the city.

RESOLVED – That the Chairperson writes on behalf of the Committee to the Cabinet Member on behalf of the Committee conveying any comments, observations and recommendations made during the way forward.

6 : MEMBER BRIEFING NOTE: FIREWORKS

The Committee received a briefing paper on fireworks, the challenges they present and suggested actions for better management of those issues. The report provided Members with an opportunity to determine if the topic should be included on the Committee's forward work programme.

The Committee considered that the Council has limited powers regarding fireworks. The only obvious options available to the Council are to restrict use on Council land and promotional opportunities. Members asked for confirmation of the extent to which these powers were being applied, and suggested that we might seek clarification.

The Committee decided to monitor this issue and provide a further update at a future meeting.

7 : MEMBER BRIEFING NOTE: CARDIFF LOCAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN
FULL REVIEW - CONSIDERATION OF PROPOSED AMENDMENTS
TABLED AT COUNCIL MEETING OF 28TH NOVEMBER 2019

The Committee received a briefing paper providing an opportunity to review the contents of the Cabinet report entitled 'Cardiff Local Development Plan Full Review – consideration of Amendments Tabled at Council Meeting on 28 November 2019'.

Members considered that the key element of the report in terms of scrutiny was the cross-committee arrangements for scrutiny of the issue. Members agreed that matter should be discussed at the Scrutiny Chairs Forum.

8 : ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE - WORK PROGRAMME
2019/20

The Committee discussed the Work Programme 2019/20. The Principal Scrutiny Officer advised that the Cabinet will receive the 'One Planet Cardiff' report on 2 April 2020. The report will set out the Council's priorities in response to the climate emergency. The report is 'red' rated and would provide enough content for useful scrutiny.

The Committee agreed to hold an additional meeting on 1 April 2020.

The Principal Scrutiny Officer asked whether Members have any particular areas or issues of focus for the 2020/21 work programme. Members were invited to email suggestions to the Principal Scrutiny Officer.

9 : URGENT ITEMS (IF ANY)

None

10 : DATE OF NEXT MEETING

Members were advised that the next Environment Scrutiny Committee is scheduled for 1 April 2020.

The meeting terminated at 6.35 pm

**CYNGOR CAERDYDD
CARDIFF COUNCIL**

ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

15 SEPTEMBER 2020

**PLANNING, TRANSPORT & ENVIRONMENT DIRECTORATE – COVID UPDATE –
SERVICE AREAS & CAPITAL PROGRAMME**

Reason for the Report

1. To provide the Committee with an opportunity to consider the current position of the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate, and the impact that the current Covid crisis has had upon service delivery and capital projects.

Background

2. On the 23rd March 2020 the United Kingdom was placed into an unprecedented lockdown to help mitigate the rapid spread of the coronavirus pandemic. This drastic action was taken to minimise social contact, reduce the number of new cases and ultimately protect lives.
3. The Council is a business that focuses on serving local people, and so is heavily reliant upon social contact. This means that limiting the number of day to day interactions has had a huge impact on the work of the Council, and the support it provides to local residents.
4. The Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate provides a broad range of services for local residents, these are set out below:
 - Planning;
 - Transport Policy, Strategy & Delivery;
 - Highway Infrastructure & Operations;
 - Energy and Sustainability;
 - Bereavement, Registration and Cardiff Dogs Home.

5. This item will provide Members with an opportunity to review the impact that the Covid crisis has had upon the services (above) and capital projects relevant to the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The relevant Cabinet Members and the Director for Planning, Transport & Environment have agreed to attend the meeting to support the briefing, which will include:
- The budget position of the Directorate as a whole, along with a summary of individual service parts;
 - How the Directorate has performed against its performance objectives during the Covid crisis;
 - A summary of the main challenges that the Directorate has faced during the Covid crisis;
 - A summary of the main opportunities that the Directorate has identified during the Covid crisis;
 - An update on new and existing capital projects relevant to the Directorate;
 - A summary of key future proposals relevant to the Directorate.

Way Forward

6. The Cabinet Members for Strategic Transport & Planning and Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment have been invited to attend the meeting. They will be supported by officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate.

Legal Implications

7. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not making policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to the Cabinet/Council will set out any legal implications arising from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be within the legal powers of the Council; (b) comply with any procedural requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d) be undertaken in accordance with the procedural

requirements imposed by the Council e.g. Scrutiny Procedure Rules; (e) be fully and properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

Financial Implications

8. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not making policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any financial implications arising from those recommendations.

RECOMMENDATIONS

9. The Committee is recommended to:
 - (i) Consider the information in this report and the information presented at the meeting;
 - (ii) Determine whether they would like to make any comments, observations or recommendations to the Cabinet on this matter; and,
 - (iii) Decide the way forward for any future scrutiny of the issues discussed.

Davina Fiore

Director of Governance & Legal Services

9 September 2020

This page is intentionally left blank

**CYNGOR CAERDYDD
CARDIFF COUNCIL**

ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE:

15 SEPTEMBER 2020

ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE – DRAFT ANNUAL REPORT 2019/20

Background

1. The Cardiff Council Constitution requires all Scrutiny Committees to ‘report annually to the Council on their workings and make recommendations for future work programmes and amended working methods if appropriate’.
2. A copy of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee’s draft Annual Report 2019/20 is attached at **Appendix 1**. This report outlines the Committee’s main activities undertaken during the 2019/20 Municipal Year. The year’s work has been set out under the following headings:
 - Briefing Information;
 - Inquiries;
 - Performance Monitoring;
 - Policy Review;
 - Pre – Decision Scrutiny.
3. The report concludes by setting out topics by scrutiny type that have been covered by the Environmental Scrutiny Committee during the 2019/20 municipal year. In addition to this, the Committee will have the opportunity to identify suitable priorities for the 2020/21 Environmental Scrutiny Committee work programme.

Legal Implications

4. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or

without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any legal implications arising from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be within the legal powers of the Council; (b) comply with any procedural requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d) be undertaken in accordance with the procedural requirements imposed by the Council e.g. Scrutiny Procedure Rules; (e) be fully and properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

Financial Implications

5. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any financial implications arising from those recommendations.

Recommendation

The Committee is recommended to consider, if necessary amend, and approve the attached Environmental Scrutiny Committee Annual Report 2019/20 for presentation to Council.

DAVINA FIORE

Director of Governance & Legal Services

9 September 2020



A Report of: Environmental Scrutiny Committee

Annual Report 2019 – 2020

May 2020



City and County of Cardiff

ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP



Councillor Ramesh Patel
(Chairperson)



Councillor Bob Derbyshire



Councillor Owen Jones



Councillor John Lancaster



Councillor Oliver Owen



Councillor Thomas Parkhill



Councillor Jacqueline Parry



Councillor Peter Wong



Councillor Ashley Wood

Note: Councillor Joe Boyle was a Member of this Committee until November 2019.

CHAIR'S FOREWORD



Councillor Ramesh Patel

Chairperson - Cardiff's Environmental Scrutiny Committee

DRAFT

INTRODUCTION

The Environmental Scrutiny Committee plays an important role in assessing service performance and informing service policy development across a range of Council services, including all aspects of transport, sustainability, and waste.

This report presents the Committee's main activities during 2019/20. Between June 2019 and May 2020 the Committee scrutinised the following topics:

- **Briefing Information** – Where the Committee receives information on a specific subject that has environmental implications to the Council and the city. During 2019/20 examples included:
 - Highway Resurfacing Programme – Member Briefing Note (**1st October 2019**)
 - Cardiff's District Heat Network – Member Update (**1st October 2019**)
 - Informal Waste Management Briefing (**5th November 2019**)
 - National Development Framework – Member Briefing Note (**20th November 2019**)
 - Public Rights of Way Improvement Plan – Member Briefing Note (**20th November 2020**)
 - Member Briefing Note: Fireworks (**3rd March 2020**)
 - Member Briefing Note: Cardiff Local Development Plan Full Review – Consideration of Proposed Amendments Tabled at Council Meeting of 28th November 2019 (**3rd March 2020**)
- **Inquiries** – Where the Committee had undertaken an examination of a topic over a period of time, resulting in a formal report to the Cabinet. During 2018/19 examples included:
 - Draft Task & Finish Report – Managing Biodiversity & Natural Environment in Cardiff (**20th November 2019**)

- Cabinet Response to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee Report Titled 'Improving Cardiff's Air Quality' (**21st January 2020**)
- Cabinet Response – Environmental Scrutiny Committee Report Titled 'Litter & Fly Tipping in Cardiff' (**March 3rd 2020**)
- **Performance Monitoring** – Where the Committee has undertaken monitoring of the Council's performance. During 2018/19 examples included:
 - Third Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report (**17th September 2019**)
 - Quarterly Performance Monitoring – Quarters 1 & 2, 2019/20 (**1st October 2019**)
 - Shared Regulatory Services – Four Year Progress Update (**20th November 2020**)
 - Shared Regulatory Services – Four Year Progress Update (**20th November 2020**)
 - Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate – Quarter 3 & Outturn Performance Reports 2018/19 (**3rd March 2020**)
 - Shared Regulatory Services – Four Year Progress Update (**20th November 2020**)
- **Policy Review** - Where the Committee has contributed to the Council's policy development processes, for example, by considering draft policy documents, and/or where the Committee has considered the implementation of policies, looking at whether this has happened in a timely manner and the impact of the policy, giving the Cabinet the opportunity to know Scrutiny Members' views about whether any changes are required.
- **Pre Decision Scrutiny** – This provides the Committee with an opportunity to evaluate and comment on policy proposals before they go to the Council's Cabinet. This gives the Cabinet the opportunity to know Scrutiny Members' views prior to making their decision. During 2019/20 examples included:

- Pre Decision Scrutiny: Air Quality Feasibility Study Final Plan - Full Business Case & City Centre Transport Improvements **(12th June 2019)**
- Pre Decision Scrutiny: Cardiff Food Strategy **(2nd July 2019)**
- Affordable Funeral Strategy & Burial Space Provision – **(17th September 2019)**
- Cardiff's Transport White Paper **(21st January 2020)**
- Education Campaign to Support Improved Recycling Performance – **(21st January 2020)**
- Draft Budget Proposals 2020/21 – Corporate Overview **(17th February 2020)**
- Draft Corporate Plan 2020 to 2023 & 2020/21 Draft Budget Proposals **(17th February 2020)**

Over the year the Scrutiny Committee held **11** committee meetings and wrote **14** letters to the Cabinet sharing their comments/ recommendations and concerns following the scrutiny of items at committee meetings. The majority of meetings were webcast during this year and attracted 375 viewers.

Members have attended a number of other scrutiny events, including work programming meetings, and pre-meetings prior to Committee and task & finish group meetings.

BRIEFING INFORMATION

Highway Resurfacing Programme – Member Briefing Note (1st October 2019)

The meeting on 1st October 2019 provided the Environmental Scrutiny Committee with the opportunity to comment on the Highway Resurfacing Programme for 2019/20. Members were able to reflect upon the content of the draft 'Highways Resurfacing Programme', considering the sections on:

- Draft Resurfacing Sites – 2019/20
- Draft Reconstruction Sites – 2019/20
- Draft Micro Sites – 2019/20
- Draft Grouted Macadam Sites – 2019/20

Members were asked to note the content of the item and discuss any future actions relating to the report.

Cardiff's District Heat Network – Member Update (1st October 2019)

The meeting on 1st October 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Cardiff's District Heat Network – Member Update'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purpose of the report was to assess the progress that has been made towards establishing Cardiff's District Heat Network; in particular to consider how close the Council was to agreeing a final business case and the necessary procurement arrangements required to deliver the scheme. Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member that included the following points:

- Members viewed it as a very positive scheme for the Council that would make a significant contribution in reducing Cardiff's carbon footprint, and thanked the officers for their hard work.
- Members asked for clarification on the potential financial risks facing the Council from the District Heat Network; asked for confirmation of the point at which the scheme would become financially unviable for the Council; and requested details of the financial monitoring process.

Informal Waste Management Briefing (5th November 2019)

The meeting on 5th November 2019 gave Members the opportunity to receive a private briefing from the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and supporting officers on recent developments in the Recycling & Waste Management Service. The meeting was held jointly with the Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee, and was structured to consider:

- The performance of Cardiff's Waste Management Service.
- The challenges & opportunities facing Cardiff's Waste Management Service.
- Future proposals relevant to Cardiff's Waste Management Service.

The contents and findings arising from the meeting will be used to identify topics for future scrutiny and potential task & finish work.

National Development Framework – Member Briefing Note – (20th November 2019)

The meeting on the 20th November 2019 provided the Environmental Scrutiny Committee with the opportunity to discuss and comment on the Cabinet response to the Welsh Government's National Development Framework 2020-2040.

The National Development Framework (NDF) is a new development plan which will set the direction for development in Wales from 2020 to 2040. At the time it was being prepared by the Welsh Government and represented the highest tier of statutory development plans in Wales. It was designed to provide a framework to be built upon by the Strategic Development Plans (SDPs) at a regional level, and Local Development Plans (LDPs) at a local authority level.

Members were asked to note the content of the item and discuss any future actions relating to the report.

Public Rights of Way Improvement Plan – Member Briefing Note (20th November 2019)

The meeting on 20th November 2019 provided the Environmental Scrutiny Committee with the opportunity to comment on the Public Rights of Way Improvement Plan. Members were able to reflect upon the content of the Cabinet report titled 'Rights of Way Improvement Plan (ROWIP) 2020-30' that was due to be presented at the Cabinet meeting on the 21st November 2019. The key sections of the new plan included:

- **Section 1** - providing an introduction and background to the ROWIP and the Cardiff Public Rights of Way (PROW) network;
- **Section 2** – providing the reasons for making a new ROWIP for 2020-30.
- **Section 3** – providing details of the New Assessment, which looks at 3 main points: Reviewing ROWIP 1: 2008-18; Evaluating the current network; and, Evaluating the public's future needs and opportunities of the network.
- **Section 4** - outlining the Statement of Action for ROWIP 2020-30, which has 5 Key Strategies for the long term aims over the 10-year period as listed below. **Section 5** - The Key Aims provided a detailed plan of the Council's priorities over the next 10 years.

Members were asked to note the content of the item and discuss any future actions relating to the report.

Member Briefing Note: Fireworks (3rd March 2020)

The meeting on 3rd March 2020 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Member Briefing Note: Fireworks'. Members were able to discuss a range of firework related challenges, including:

- Firework safety issues;
- Firework Code;
- Fireworks Law in the United Kingdom;
- Fireworks Available to the Public;
- Restrictions on sale & use;
- A range of RSPCA Proposals;
- House of Commons Petitions Committee Fireworks Report.

Members were asked to note the content of the item and discuss any future actions relating to the report. At the end of the meeting the Committee agreed to monitor the problem, and consider adding it to their work programme in future.

Member Briefing Note: Cardiff Local Development Plan Full Review – Consideration of Proposed Amendments Tabled at Council Meeting of 28th November 2019 (3rd March 2020)

The meeting on 3rd March 2020 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Member Briefing Note: Cardiff Local Development Plan Full Review – Consideration of Proposed Amendments Tabled at Council Meeting of 28th November 2019'. During this item Members were able to discuss the reasons for the Cabinet the report, and the following proposed amendments:

- **Amendment 1:** *Council agrees as part of the full review of the Local Development Plan, Cardiff Council will introduce Green Belt(s) in areas of Cardiff.*
- **Amendment 2:** *Council agrees that as part of the full review of the Local Development Plan, Cardiff Council will ensure that there is proper public transport easily accessible for residents of all new developments and in place at an early stage.*
- **Amendment 3:** *Council agrees that as part of the full review of the Local Development Plan, Cardiff Council will ensure that the design of new developments will be relevant to the local area and of the highest quality achievable.*

In addition to this, Members received a briefing on the next steps for Cardiff's Local Development Plan and were asked to note the contents of the paper.

INQUIRIES

Cabinet Response to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee Report Titled 'Improving Cardiff's Air Quality' – (21st January 2020)

The meeting on 21st January gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on the Cabinet Response to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee report titled 'Improving Cardiff's Air Quality'. The Cabinet Members for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment; Strategic Planning & Transport; and Social Care, Health & Well-being attended the meeting and were supported by officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. Details of the Cabinet response to the report were provided, and following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Members that included the following points:

- **Positive Report Response** - The Committee was pleased by number of recommendations that had been accepted, and the overall positive response to the report. In particular, they welcomed the comments that were made by Councillor Wild during his opening statement that thanked the Committee for the piece of work and the valuable contribution that it made.
- **Recommendation 6 – Low Emission Neighbourhoods** – During the meeting Members questioned why Recommendation 6 had been rejected, when the draft 'Transport White Paper' had talked about similar initiatives being delivered across the city, for example, 'streets for health'. Councillor Wild explained that if the timing had been slightly different, and with some reflection, 'Recommendation 6' could have been accepted as it is something that aligns with the aims of the Transport White Paper. Members asked the Cabinet Members to revisit the recommendation and provide the Committee with feedback on the conclusion.
- **Bold Taxi Statement** - The first part of 'Recommendation 19' stated that:

- *The Council makes a clear statement that sets out the Council's ambitions for taxi emission standards in the city and explains out how this might be achieved, for example, Nottingham has stated that it wants to significantly reduce taxi emissions in the city by converting all of its taxi fleet to electric by 2025.*

Members felt that this had not been properly addressed in the Cabinet response, and asked if there were any proposals to publish a target date for improving taxi standards. The Committee emphasised that the Council needed to provide a positive statement to help drive taxi improvements, and asked the Cabinet Members to reconsider the response.

- **Local Motor Industry** - The Committee was disappointed at the response to 'Recommendations 23 & 24' which focused on developing closer working ties with the local motor industry. They felt that developing these relationships could only help increase the popularity of low emission vehicles, which would be a positive thing for Cardiff. The Committee asked the Cabinet Members to reconsider the response, and as a minimum ensure that all local car dealerships were aware of all of the electric charging points in Cardiff, including those provided by the Council.
- **Electric Charging Points** - At the meeting the Chair asked about the new electric charging points that had been rolled out across Cardiff, along with the rationale as to how and why the sites had been selected. The Committee asked for details of all of the new Council electric charging points and the information that was used to select the sites.

Environmental Scrutiny Committee – Managing Biodiversity & Natural Environment in Cardiff

During much of 2019/20 the Committee worked on an inquiry titled 'Managing Biodiversity & Natural Environment in Cardiff'. Scoping meetings took place in April 2019, and a terms of reference for the inquiry was agreed. This is set out below:

The aim of the inquiry is to provide Members with the opportunity to explore and consider how the Council can support and help improve the biodiversity in Cardiff. In particular this will include scrutiny of:

- *The development of Cardiff's Biodiversity Forward Plan, for example, its structure, aims and objectives;*
- *The ongoing implications of Cardiff's Biodiversity Forward Plan, for example, future reporting and monitoring of the document;*
- *The approach taken by other Welsh local authorities to develop biodiversity forward plans and to identify best practice in this area;*
- *The Council's current role, obligations and statutory / legislative requirements for supporting and improving biodiversity;*
- *The importance of Cardiff's biodiversity and ecosystems;*
- *The resources available to support and improve biodiversity in Cardiff;*
- *Community collaboration and other partnership working approaches to understand how they help support and enhance biodiversity in Cardiff;*
- *The importance of raising awareness of biodiversity issues in Cardiff – internally, with key stakeholders and the public;*
- *Cardiff's Green Infrastructure Strategy – including the benefits of green infrastructure and ecosystem services;*
- *Green Infrastructure Management – including the Green Infrastructure Group;*

- *Cardiff Green Infrastructure SPG and Planned Development;*
- *The Green Infrastructure Spatial Strategy;*
- *Green Infrastructure Implementation Programme (Pollinators Action Plan, Individual Park Management Plans, Local Nature Plan, River Corridors, Tree Strategy, Cross border initiatives, other plans & projects);*
- *Sustainable drainage – links with the SuDS Approval Body process.*

The task & finish report was completed in November 2019, and in doing this the Committee undertook and delivered the following:

- 7 task group meetings;
- 15 separate witness sessions;
- Dealing with 22 witnesses (14 external to the Council);
- Worked closely with the Cabinet Members and Council staff who are responsible for managing biodiversity and the natural environment in Cardiff;
- Received witness contributions from a range of expert witnesses.

The draft task & finish report was approved at the Committee meeting on the 20th November, and then presented to Cabinet at their meeting on the 23rd January 2020. In concluding the task & finish exercise made a series of recommendations including the following:

- Asking the Council to declare a biodiversity emergency to sit alongside the climate change emergency;
- To employ an additional Ecologist or Section 6 Officer to help ensure that the Council meets the requirements of the Section 6 Duty;
- Where practically possible, to limit the use of pesticides such as glyphosate across the Council estate;
- The Council should build a biodiversity well-being commitment into Capital Ambition, decision-making processes, business plans and policies;
- The Council should link biodiversity and the resilience well-being objective into Cardiff's Local Development Plan when it is revised in 2020;

- The Council should deliver a series of actions to improve connectivity of habitat across Cardiff. This would help enhance biodiversity in the city;
- The Council should create and publish a community growing policy;
- The Council should work with Elected Members, partner organisations, volunteer groups and the public to develop a 'Plant a Tree Scheme'.

The Committee is due to receive a full Cabinet response to the task & finish report during 2020/21.

DRAFT

Cabinet Response – Environmental Scrutiny Committee Report Titled ‘Litter & Fly Tipping in Cardiff’ – (March 3rd 2020)

The meeting on 3rd March gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on the Cabinet Response to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee report titled ‘Litter & Fly Tipping in Cardiff’ . The Cabinet Members for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment attended the meeting and was supported by officers from the People & Communities Directorate. Details of the Cabinet response to the report were provided, and following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Members that included the following points:

- **Enforcement Teams** – Members asked for further details of the proposed ‘Whole Council’ approach to litter enforcement which they were told would involve better use of a wide range of Council resources across the city. The Committee agreed to add it to the work programme for 2020/21.
- **Camera Powers** – Members were supportive of the use of cameras to target littering offences, particularly for litter thrown from vehicles on key routes into and out of the city. They agreed to support any Welsh Government lobbying that the Council decided to undertake to enhance the use of cameras to target littering offences.
- **Litter Action Plan** – During the meeting an officer explained that the full response to the report recommendations would be put into an action plan. The Committee look forward to receiving a copy of this document, and hope that it will deal with concerns that they had regarding the ‘partially accepted’ and ‘accepted in principle’ responses.
- **Cardiff App** – The Committee asked that all new Cardiff residents are automatically sent information on the app when registering for Council tax; this they felt would help increase the uptake of the app and in turn help improve the collection of litter and fly tipping data.

- **QR Codes for Bins** – During the meeting a Member suggested that placing QR codes on bins would be a cheap and effective way of monitoring the use of bins in the city. The Assistant Director for Street Scene thought that this was a good idea and confirmed that he would look into how it might work in Cardiff. Members asked for a progress update on the suggestion once it had been reviewed.
- **Recycling & Pop Up Bins** – Members were disappointed that the Council was not looking to roll out recycling and pop up bins to wards outside the city centre. They felt that using these type of bins would encourage better recycling habits, and asked the Cabinet Member to reconsider how these are allocated across Cardiff.
- **Four Day Working** – Members noted that the idea of four day working was being considered. The Committee asked that they were kept informed on any developments, and agreed to carry out scrutiny on any new proposals that are brought forward.

PERFORMANCE MONITORING

Third Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report (17th September 2019)

The meeting on the 17th September 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Third Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport and officers from Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purpose of the report was to provide a short briefing to Members on the content of a Cabinet report titled 'Third Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report' that was due to be presented to Cabinet on Thursday 26th September 2019. In addition to this, Members were able to ask any questions that they had on the delivery of the Cardiff's Local Development Plan.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport that included the following points:

- Members were concerned that measures contained within the Annual Monitoring Report suggested that in the last three years the level of physical activity had declined. They asked what the point of the Local Development Plan was if people weren't getting healthier, and asked for an explanation on how the Local Development Plan could be used to reverse this trend.
- Members were concerned that only 40% of the housing completions set out against the Local Development Plan had been achieved, and that only 25% of the affordable housing allocation has been completed creating a 15% lag between the two targets. This was a particular concern because 75% of the affordable housing target needed to be delivered in less than seven years. The Committee asked for assurance that progress would be

made in the next few years to significantly increase the number of affordable properties in Cardiff.

- The Annual Monitoring Report showed a gradual decline in the number of sustainable travel journeys for education, stating that trips for '*education has seen a significant decrease*'. Members felt that this was a concern since school traffic was significantly adding to congestion in Cardiff at the beginning and end of every school day, and so what the Council proposed to do to reverse the trend and increase the number of sustainable journeys to and from school.
- During the meeting there was some debate around planning decisions for student accommodation in the city. Some Members questioned the temporary change of use planning status that had been applied for and granted on some student developments in Cardiff – this meant that, on a temporary basis, the accommodation could now be occupied by other residents, i.e. not students. They were concerned that a precedent had been set, meaning that other developers could follow suit should their developments fail to attract sufficient numbers of students. Members felt that this presented risks in terms of building standards and receipt of planning obligation monies. The Committee went on to question the level of demand for student accommodation in Cardiff, particularly as the Annual Monitoring Report states '*current evidence shows the further strength of the student accommodation market in Cardiff*'. A Member cited a recent Savills report which provided an opposite view. The Committee asked for a copy of the evidence used to support the claim that '*current evidence shows the further strength of the student accommodation market in Cardiff*'.
- The Committee welcomed the positive cycling results that were included in the Annual Monitoring Report, however, they were concerned that congestion levels continue to increase across the city (for example, from 27% in 2017 to 28% by 2018). They felt that reducing congestion levels in Cardiff should be one of the fundamental principles of the Local Development Plan, and agreed to monitor the progress made in this area.

Quarterly Performance Monitoring – Quarters 1 & 2, 2019/20 (1st October 2019)

The meeting on the 1st October 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Quarterly Performance Monitoring – Quarters 1 & 2, 2019/20'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment, the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport and officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment and Peoples & Communities Directorates.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent letters to the Cabinet Members for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and Strategic Planning & Transport that included the following points:

The Committee was concerned that Cardiff would not achieve the Welsh Government recycling target of 64% during 2019/20. The 2018/19 outturn result for the recycling indicator was 59.3%, which meant that the city had to achieve a 4.7% increase in one year. Members felt that achieving such a large increase would require a significant change to Cardiff's waste collection approach, and that currently no such proposals exist. Swansea City Council, a comparable Welsh local authority, achieved 63% recycling during 2018/19 – this meant that it only had to achieve a 1% improvement in 2019/20. Members felt that the Council should look at how Swansea had achieved 63% recycling, and then analyse the reasons for the 3.7% difference. Understanding the differences between the results of the two comparable local authorities should provide Cardiff with some of the answers that it needs.

- The Committee was concerned by the very high sickness rates in the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. At the end of Quarter 3 the Directorate was anticipating 17.6 FTE sick days per employee for 2018/19. Officers explained that they were committed to reducing the current sickness levels, but that they had to work within the existing Council sickness policy. Members accepted this, however, felt that something had to change as sickness was having an impact on budgets

and service delivery. The Committee asked for clarification on the following:

- **Return to Work Interviews** – the Directorate was completing return to work interviews in 98% of reported sickness cases. This was a very high figure and suggested that managers were working hard to follow the Council’s sickness policy. Unfortunately sickness rates had continued to rise, suggesting that the policy was not be working effectively in parts of the Council. Members asked for confirmation if there were any plans in place to review the effectiveness of the policy.
- **Overspend Costs** – the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate was overspent by £1.265 million in 2018/19. The biggest contributor to this deficit was the Recycling & Waste Management Service with an overspend of £2.947 million. Members asked for confirmation on how much of the overspend could be directly attributed to high sickness rates, for example, the ‘back filling’ of posts due to sickness.
- **Increasing Sickness Rates** – Members noted that sickness rates had continually increased for a number of years; this was having an impact on budgets and service delivery. Reversing this change required strategic planning and leadership from the Council’s Senior Management Team. The Committee asked for a summary of the proposals that the Head of Paid Service and the Senior Management Team had put forward to stem this increase and ultimately reduce sickness levels in the Directorate and across the wider Council.
- A Member asked about plans for a new Household Waste Recycling Centre in the north of Cardiff, and was told that at present the Council had been unable to identify a suitable site. The Committee asked for a list of potential sites that have been identified, and the reasons why these had been deemed unsuitable, along with assurance that the search for a new site would continue.

- Members feel that they need some clarity on the conflicting sustainable travel data that had been provided to the Committee. For example, sustainable travels seems to be increasing, but at the same time journeys by bus and train are declining. In addition to this congestion had been increasing while modal shift targets appeared to have changed. To help address this the Committee asked for a list of all the transport performance indicators being used by the Council, to include details of how these are defined, how they are measured, and the results for the last three years.

- Some Members expressed concern at the reducing number of sustainable journeys to and from school in Cardiff. This was a worry because school traffic made a significant contribution to congestion twice a day; reduced active travel, and failed to create a sustainable travel mind-set in young people. The Committee suggested that the Council should look at transport to schools again, and review its approach to bus provision.

- At the meeting it was noted that the Highways Service had an underspend of £1.124 million in 2018/19, and that this saving had helped to reduce the wider Directorate overspend to £1.265 million. The Committee was advised during Budget Scrutiny that the total projected Highway budget for 2018/19 (capital and revenue) was £5.804 million, and so were concerned that that a £1.124 million underspend (approximately 19% of the total budget) had been achieved in an area that is consistently considered a citizen priority. They felt that such a saving was short sighted, as the Highway Asset requires sustained investment to ensure that the speed of deterioration does not increase. They asked the Cabinet Member to:
 - Confirm from which part(s) of the Highways budget the savings were achieved;
 - Explain how the decision was taken to allow an underspend against this budget;
 - Provide details of any consultation that was undertaken around taking this saving;
 - Provide the Committee with assurance that this underspend has not contributed to any unnecessary deterioration of the Highway Asset.

Shared Regulatory Services – Four Year Progress Update (20th November 2019)

The meeting on the 20th November 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Shared Regulatory Services – Four Year Progress Update'. The item was supported by Councillor Michael Michael - Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment; Councillor Lynda Thorne - Cabinet Member for Housing & Communities and Councillor Norma Mackie, Chair of Cardiff's Licensing & Public Protection Committee. They will be supported by officers from Shared Regulatory Services and the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. In addition to this, representatives from the Wales Audit Office were in attendance to discuss the content of the report titled 'Delivering with Less – Environmental Health Services'. The purposed of the report was to:

- **Four Year Progress Update:** Consider the performance of Shared Regulatory Services since it was established in May 2015;
- **Annual Report 2018/19:** Consider the Shared Regulatory Services Annual Report 2018/19; and,
- **Wales Audit Office Report:** To consider the findings and actions falling out of the recent Wales Audit Office report titled 'Delivering with Less – Environmental Health Services'.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment that included the following points:

- **Taxi Marshals** – Members sought clarification on the number of taxi marshals operating in the city centre, the hours that they worked and details of who held responsibility for managing the staff.
- **HMO Licensing Scheme** – Members acknowledge the success of the HMO licensing scheme in Cathays and Plasnewydd and encouraged the Council to expand the geographical range of the policy to other parts of the city.

- **High Rise Buildings & Fire Safety** – At the meeting an officer commented on the proportionately high number of high-rise buildings in Cardiff that had recently failed fire safety tests. This had created a significant safety issue and placed many residents in a very challenging financial position. Members were concerned by this and referred the item to the Community & Adult Services Scrutiny Committee.
- **Shared Regulatory Services – Statutory Obligations** – Members asked for confirmation that the Shared Regulatory Services was delivering against all of the Council’s statutory obligations, and to provide supporting evidence to verify that this was the case.
- **Enforcement Action Income** – At the meeting it was acknowledged that taking enforcement action through Shared Regulatory Services was a costly exercise, and that even when successful, neither the Council or Shared Regulatory Services was entitled to keep the cost of the fine. Members felt that the value of the fines should be passed back to the Council or Shared Regulatory Services and reinvested back into frontline service delivery, and recommended that the Council lobby the Welsh Government to ask that the fine money is passed back to local authorities in future.

Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate – Quarter 3 & Outturn Performance Reports 2018/19 – (3rd March 2020)

The meeting on the 3rd March 2020 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate – Quarter 3 & Outturn Performance Reports 2018/19'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment; the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport; and officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment and People & Communities Directorates. The purpose of the report was to review the performance reports relevant to the terms of reference of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee for Quarter 1 (April to June 2019) and Quarter 2 (July to September 2019).

Following discussion, questions and comments, the Committee sent letters to the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and Strategic Planning & Transport that included the following points:

- **Recycling Target Fines** – It was apparent that the Council would not achieve the Welsh Government Recycling target of 64% during 2019/20. Member asked for confirmation on, i) the value of the potential fine that the Welsh Government could be levied against the Council for failing to reach the target; ii) details of the work and dialogue that the Council was undertaking with Welsh Government to avoid the fines being applied; iii) examples of local authorities who missed the recycling target in 2018/19.
- **LEAMS DATA** – A Member asked for an explanation as to why Quarter 1 (96.54%) produced a better score for the indicator described as '*the percentage of highways and relevant land inspected of a high or acceptable standard of cleanliness*' than Quarter 3 (94.32%), as in his experience Quarter 1 was always worse for litter than Quarter 3.
- **Enforcement Teams** – A Member asked for details of what the proposed 'Whole Council' approach to litter enforcement entailed. He was told that it would involve better use of a wide range of Council resources across the

city, and that they were hoping for Cabinet support to fund the proposals in the summer. The Committee asked for more information on the scheduled changes and agreed to add proposals to the future work programme.

- **Camera Powers** – Members were supportive of the use of cameras to target littering offences, and acknowledged that existing legislation wasn't strong enough. They recommended that the Council should lobby the Welsh Government to improve existing powers to enhance the use of cameras to target littering offences.
- **QR Codes for Bins** – During the meeting a Member suggested that placing QR codes on bins would be a cheap and effective way of monitoring the use of bins in the city. The Assistant Director for Street Scene thought that this was a good idea and confirmed that he would look into how it might work in Cardiff. The Committee asked for a progress update on the matter after it had been reviewed.
- **Four Day Working** – Members noted that the idea of four day working was being considered, and asked for regular updates and an opportunity to scrutinise any future proposals.
- **Funding for Active Travel Schemes** – Members asked for details on existing sums and current funding bids that are in place to support active travel for schools.

PRE DECISION SCRUTINY

Pre Decision Scrutiny: Air Quality Feasibility Study Final Plan - Full Business Case & City Centre Transport Improvements (12th June 2019)

The meeting on the 12th June 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Pre Decision Scrutiny: Air Quality Feasibility Study Final Plan - Full Business Case & City Centre Transport Improvements'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport; the Cabinet Member for Social Care, Health & Well-being; Dr Porter from Public Health Wales; and officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purpose of the meeting was to undertake pre decision scrutiny on a report titled 'Air Quality Feasibility Study Final Plan – Full Business Case & City Centre Transport Improvements', prior to it being received at the Cabinet meeting on the 13th June 2019.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Members that included the following points:

- **Preferred Option Modelling** – At the start of the meeting there was some confusion around exactly what had been included in the modelling for the preferred option. For example, it was explained that the bus station would not be complete by the start of 2021 and, therefore, it had not been modelled into the overall scheme. This created some confusion since the new bus station was one of the main features on the map setting out the new City Centre Schemes. Members asked for clarification on which developments (for example the new bus station and BBC offices at Central Square) had been built into the modelling, and which assumptions had been used in terms of numbers of people and journey movements.
- **Castle Street & Westgate Street** – Members raised some concerns about how the air quality improvements would be achieved in Castle Street and Westgate Street, given that the existing traffic would still have to pass

through a narrower area. They suggested that a large volume of traffic would still try to access what is already a restricted area, which in turn would slow vehicles down and increase pollution. They were also concerned that some traffic would just be displaced to other parts of the city, resulting in the air quality problem just being moved. To respond to this Members asked for clarification on the following:

- If the preferred option (CASAP) reduces traffic into the city centre by 30%, given that the model only assumes a 3.5% modal shift where does the balance of the traffic go.
 - If a clear air zone (CAZ) had been introduced, by how much would traffic entering the city centre have been reduced? Also, please confirm where the traffic displaced by the CAZ would go.
- **Taxi Mitigation Schemes** – At the meeting Members were told that a proposed £1.86m had been allocated in the preferred option to support taxi mitigation schemes. An officer explained that the proposal would be available to taxi drivers who were registered in Cardiff and each application would be limited to a maximum contribution of £3,000 per driver. Members were also told that the £3,000 would be allocated to cover running costs and not a front loaded capital contribution to support the initial purchase of a low emission vehicle. The Committee was concerned by this as they believe that the main barrier to purchasing a low emission vehicle for most drivers is the initial cost of purchase and not the annual running cost. Members asked that the Cabinet review this approach and consider the option of providing the grant as a front loaded cost to assist with the actual purchase.
 - **Queen Street Cycling Options** – Members were very supportive of the introduction of more and better quality cycling lanes, however, they were not convinced by the ‘City Centre Loop’ that takes cyclists around the city centre via Boulevard De Nantes and Dumfries Place. The Committee felt that many cyclists who are looking to cross the city centre would ignore the

new loop and simply cycle across Queen Street instead. With this in mind Members asked:

- That the Council review reviews the option of allowing cycling on Queen Street;
 - For details of the consultation that had been carried out with cycling groups in developing this section of cycling infrastructure;
 - For details of the modelling used to assess the number of cyclists using this scheme;
 - If the Council had been able to draw any information or data from the introduction of the Nextbike scheme to help with the development of the proposals.
- **Clean Air Zone (CAZ) v Non Charging Zone (CASAP)** - During the way forward a Member asked if the comparison between the CASAP and CAZ was a fair one. He expanded this by asking why the CAZ had been modelled at all, given that the CASAP achieves compliance and that the government guidance states that '*a CAZ should only be implemented if non-charging alternatives don't achieve compliance*'. As a follow on to this the Committee asked the Cabinet Member to explain, i) if the comparison between the CAZ and CASAP was a fair one, and if so why this was the case; ii) why the CAZ was modelled at all, given that the CASAP achieved compliance.
 - **Taxis Registered in other local authority areas** – At the meeting Members commented on the large number of taxis that are registered by neighbouring local authority areas and are freely operating in Cardiff. Members understood that this was largely out of the control of the Council, and that a Welsh Government review of taxi services was ongoing – the hope was that this piece of work would standardise taxi licensing across Wales. In the letter the Committee asked the Cabinet Member to encourage the Welsh Government to complete its review of taxi services so that it does not undermine the challenge of achieving air quality compliance in Cardiff.

- **EV Infrastructure** - During the meeting a Member asked for details of the proposals for the provision of public EV charging infrastructure in the city. Members felt that charging infrastructure would encourage drivers to switch to lower emission vehicles; without such provision it would be difficult for the change to happen.
- **Mandatory Retrofitting of Buses** – The Committee was told that the preferred option assumed an 80% uptake of remaining non-Euro 6 buses to Euro 6. Some Members were of the view that mandatory retrofitting of buses should be set at 100%, assuming that the Council was agreeing to cover the cost (based on the £2.25million contribution). They believed that this would send out a clear message, and would be consistent with the proposed changes to taxi licensing standards.

Pre Decision Scrutiny: Cardiff Food Strategy (2nd July 2019)

The meeting on the 2nd July 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Pre Decision Scrutiny: Cardiff Food Strategy'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purposed of the report was to consider the development of the Cardiff Food Strategy prior to it being received by Cabinet on the 26th September 2019.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment that included the following points:

- **Hydroponic Hub** – Members found the idea of a 'Hydroponic Hub' very interesting, particularly as such a venture could provide an opportunity for local residents to grow a range of produce out of season. Members acknowledged there was an established allotment community in Cardiff, and that many of these would welcome an out of season opportunity to grow food. On this basis the Committee recommended that if the Council did propose developing a 'Hydroponic Hub' then it should engage with the allotment community to establish interest and commitment to take the project forward.
- **Local Food Market** – Members feel that Cardiff has a strong local food community, but lacks a permanent base where the local food offer can be showcased. A Member pointed out that the city does not have an equivalent of Borough Market, and that such a facility would add sustainability, economic and tourism benefits. The Committee asked the Cabinet Member to look into the feasibility of developing such a venue in the city centre.
- **Local Food Quality Mark** - The Committee supported the idea of creating a local food quality mark for Cardiff. They felt that this could be introduced

to identify locally produced food that meets an agreed standard. It would help local food growers, support the local economy and incentivise sustainability.

- **Beef** - During the meeting a Member suggested that the Council should probably play a greater role in determining what was consumed at Council establishments and in school canteens. For example, beef, beef and beef had dominated the menu at his daughter's school for the last three days. He went on to highlight the current environmental crisis facing the planet, making reference to the negative impact that the beef industry has on large parts of the world. He continued by suggesting that the Council should use its influence in the procurement process to understand where our beef came from, for example, providing assurance that it was locally produced and not a product of Brazil where huge deforestation is taking place to enable production. He concluded by suggesting that the Council needed to be sure of the carbon footprint of the food that it procures and consumes. The Committee agreed with this suggestion and encouraged the Council to, i) do all it can to produce a greener menu that supports the Council's wider carbon reduction commitment; ii) encourage schools to do more to promote healthy eating on the curriculum, while at the same time promoting food sustainability.

Affordable Funeral Strategy & Burial Space Provision – (17th September 2019)

The meeting on the 17th September 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Affordable Funeral Strategy & Burial Space Provision'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purpose of the report was to provide the Committee with an overview of the national issue around the rising costs of funerals, and to consider Cardiff's Draft Affordable Funerals Strategy that seeks to inform the public of funeral costs and the options they have to procure an affordable and dignified funeral.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment that included the following points:

- Members congratulated the Cabinet Member and the staff in Bereavement & Registration Services for winning 'Best Service Team of the Year – Cemetery & Crematorium Category' at the APSE awards.
- During the meeting Members were told that Bereavement & Registration Services was looking into the development of some type of funeral plan or bond to help local residents to save for funeral expenses. The Committee asked for information on the type of plan or scheme that the Council was looking to deliver, along with an explanation of the potential barriers and benefits that various options might provide.
- The Committee was told that people are generally reluctant to talk about future funeral arrangements, and that avoiding such a conversation could make things difficult for those left to pick up the pieces and potentially channel families and individuals into funeral poverty. Members were told that Bereavement & Registration Services was due to start a 'Broader Conversations Campaign' that would provide 'pre-need advice' along with counselling and support for those struggling to manage the financial and

emotional difficulties that can accompany the planning of a funeral. The Committee welcomed the roll out of such a campaign, and asked for assurance that all staff providing the counselling and advice were properly trained.

- Members welcomed the news that the Council had identified an ashes scatter area along the River Taff, and asked for details of the exact location prior to any public announcement.

DRAFT

Cardiff's Transport White Paper (21st January 2020)

The meeting on the 21st January gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Cardiff's Transport White Paper'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport, officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate; Mark Barry - Professor of Practice in Connectivity, Cardiff University and Stuart Cole CBE – Professor of Transport at the University of South Wales. The purpose of the report was to consider the content of the draft 'Transport White Paper: Transport Vision 2030', and to discuss the options for funding the delivery of the proposed transport infrastructure. The report was due to be presented to Cabinet on Thursday 23rd January 2020.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport that included the following points:

- **A Positive Transport Ambition** - Members were supportive of the proposed ten-year transport vision that is set out in the draft 'Transport White Paper'. They felt that if the combination of schemes contained within the document were delivered, then moving around Cardiff would become easier, air quality would improve and both carbon emissions from vehicles and congestion would reduce.
- **Cross City Connectivity** - The Committee was fully behind the proposals to improve connectivity across Cardiff. They believed that projects such as the Cardiff Crossrail Tram – Train Line, the Cardiff Circle Line and new cross-city bus network would address this longstanding problem.
- **Importance of Engaging with Bus Companies** – Improving bus provision in the city is a core aim of the draft 'Transport White Paper'. Indeed, section 2 of the document titled 'Bus Growth' is exclusively dedicated to improving bus travel into and around the city. During the meeting a Member commented on the importance of the bus as a mode of

transport in the draft 'Transport White Paper', and asked for details on how much engagement had happened with the various private bus companies who operate in the city. He was told that regular engagement had taken place with the private bus companies, however, much work still needed to happen to deliver the vision set out in the plan – for example, developing governance and partnership agreements. The Committee see that bus has a central place in Cardiff's transport plans, therefore, ask that you ensure that the Council works and fully engages with all of the private bus companies during every stage of the delivery of the plan.

- **Deliverability & Funding** - The Committee supported the ambition and vision contained within the draft 'Transport White Paper', whilst having a number of concerns on the deliverability and funding of the proposals. To ease concerns they asked:
 - For assurance that the 10 year vision was achievable, along with an explanation as to why this was the case.
 - That planning was underpinned by 'lessons learnt' from other major projects infrastructure and transport projects.
 - That the Council adhered to best practice throughout delivery.
 - That 'slippage' was built into the planning timeline and that the Council maintains a series of 'plan B' options to turn to should the worst happen.
 - That transport infrastructure needed to be in place before any charging takes place, and that any monies raised should be specifically ring-fenced for transport infrastructure.
 - An explanation on how the £1 bus journeys scheme would work, and provide detail of how it might be funded.

Education Campaign to Support Improved Recycling Performance (21st January 2020)

The meeting on the 21st January 2020 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Education Campaign to Support Improved Recycling Performance'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and officers from the People & Communities Directorate. The purpose of the report was to provide the Committee with an opportunity to consider the report due to be received by Cabinet on Thursday 23rd January and to review:

- The outline proposals for the new education campaign that would focus upon recycling performance;
- The draft strategy titled 'Working together to improve recycling for Cardiff'.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment that included the following points:

- Members welcome the introduction of the 'Pink Sticker' scheme, seeing it as a positive step forward that should help Cardiff make improvements on current recycling rates.
- The Committee felt that the Council could apply a similar 'Pink Sticker' approach to the municipal waste stream, i.e. a sticker that is used to identify municipal waste that includes material that can be recycled. They accepted the argument that such a change should not be introduced immediately as the public needed to adapt to the current proposal, however, they felt that this was something that the Council could look at in the future.
- Members were told that the Council was looking to enhance waste collection technology, for example, by potentially introducing RFID stickers to improve the quality and speed of data collection. The Committee welcomed this approach as it would improve the data held by the Council,

putting it in an informed position so that it can better target waste collection resources.

- The Committee felt that to maximise the impact of the 'Pink Sticker' scheme the Council waste webpage page needed to be as engaging and interactive as possible, therefore, they recommended that Recycling & Waste Management review the information on the site to identify how improvements could be made.
- A Member commented on a number of missed nappy collections, and the problems that this had presented for some local residents. An officer explained that the Council was working with Welsh Government to improve the reliability of collection schedules, and to roll out 'yellow nappy bins' across the city. The Committee welcomed this development.

Draft Budget Proposals 2020/21 & Corporate Overview / Draft Corporate Plan 2020 to 2023 (17th February 2020)

The meeting on the 17th February 2020 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on the Draft Budget Proposals 2020/21 & Corporate Overview / Draft Corporate Plan 2020 to 2023. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment; the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport; the Cabinet Member for Finance, Modernisation & Performance and officers from Resources, People & Communities and Planning, Transport & Environment Directorates. The purpose of the report was to provide Members with an opportunity to scrutinise the sections of the Council's Draft Corporate Plan 2020 to 2023, and Draft Cabinet 2020/21 budget consultation proposals relevant to the terms of reference of the Committee.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Finance, Modernisation & Performance that included the following points:

Corporate Overview

- **Capital Borrowing Concerns** - During the meeting Members asked how sustainable the Council's proposed Capital Programme was over the next five years, and questioned the impact that this might have upon the wider revenue budget. The five year capital programme contained £938,875 million in proposals; much of which would need to be repaid by funds from the Council's revenue budget. An officer explained to the Committee that the current proposals had been assessed during the budget setting process, and that they were deemed both deliverable and affordable. Given the wider uncertainty and risk facing the United Kingdom economy, the Committee asked for assurance that the allocated capital budget was affordable.

Strategic Planning & Transport Portfolio - Draft Budget Proposals 2020/21

- **Staffing for Transport Projects** – A Member expressed concern that the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate was reducing staff numbers at a time when the number of schemes coming through was increasing (particularly transport related). He was told that most of the capital funds for the new transport schemes would include provision for the temporary recruitment of staff to help deliver the projects. He and the Committee were satisfied by this answer, however, they asked for assurance that:

 - The Council would be able to recruit the required number of staff, with the appropriate skills, and within the necessary timescale to deliver the new transport schemes;
 - The Council would be able to employ suitably qualified staff on short term contracts to deliver the work, rather than have to rely on expensive consultants.

- **Cycle Parking Provision** – At the meeting a Member questioned why some of the cycle parking provision in the city centre was so poorly located, and asked what could be done to identify better sites in future. As an example, he referred to separate cycle parking facilities adjacent to Marks & Spencer and close to Miller & Carter – both in the city centre. The Committee asked if the Cabinet Member could:

 - Confirm the process that is used to identify suitable cycle parking facilities in Cardiff;
 - Provide details of any consultation that might take place prior to deciding on where to locate cycle parking.

- **Capital Allocation – Cardiff City Transport Services Limited (Cardiff Bus)** – Capital line 59 allocated £13.6million for Cardiff Bus across the financial years of 2020/21 and 2021/22. The budget line explained that the funding would be '*subject to a further report to and decision of Full Council, due diligence and other matters*', with the ultimate aim of providing '*a package of support for Cardiff City Transport Services*

Limited'. The Committee was concerned by the amount of capital allocated to support Cardiff Bus over two years, and asked for regular updates as developments unfolded.

- **Moving Traffic & Attended Parking Enforcement Cameras** – Line 93 of the capital programme allocated £475,000 towards the installation of 'moving traffic cameras' and 'attended parking enforcement cameras' on new routes in the city centre. The Committee welcomed the introduction of the cameras in the city centre, particularly if they are used to target problem and illegal parking, for example, blocking of bus lanes. The Committee asked for confirmation of the routes that the new cameras were going to target, which offences they would prioritise and where they would be introduced.

Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment Portfolio - Draft Budget Proposals 2020/21

❖ Delivered by the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate

- **Flooding** – At the meeting reference was made to the recent flooding that had taken place and the impact that this had on local residents and the Council. Comments were also made about the growing threat of climate change, and the potential implications that this could have upon coastal and river flooding. The Committee asked for an explanation on what the Council was doing to mitigate all types of flood risk, the resources being allocated and any long term forward thinking that was taking place.

❖ Delivered by the People & Communities Directorate

- **New Household Waste Recycling Centre in North Cardiff** – Line 39 of the capital programme allocated £3.325 million across the financial years 2020/21, 2021/22 and 2022/23 for the provision of a new Household Waste Recycling Centre in North Cardiff. At the meeting it was explained to Members that creating such a site in the north of the city was still a political commitment, however, the practicality of identifying a suitable site remained a challenge. The Committee was informed that work would

continue to identify a suitable site, and that capital funding had been committed to the scheme. Members asked for a progress update on identifying a suitable scheme, to include details of sites that had been considered along with a realistic timescale for delivering the new facility.

- **Love Where You Live** – Members welcomed the additional £60,000 that had been included in the budget to help with the delivery of the revamped ‘Love Where You Live’ campaign. They felt that the scheme was an excellent educational / awareness raising tool that encouraged volunteer participation and, therefore, provided excellent value for money. The wider budget allocated £4.446 million of new monies for dealing with the collection, removal and processing of waste; this was a huge amount of money when compared to the resources put towards the ‘Love Where You Live’ campaign. Members commented that improving how the Council managed waste and achieved cleaner streets was not just down to how it processed, collected and removed waste, it also involved raising awareness and better public education. Following on from this comment the Committee asked for:
 - Details of what the £60,000 for ‘Love Where You Live’ would provide, for example, staff, equipment, promotional budget, etc..;
 - An increase in the funding for ‘Love Where You Live’ as the scheme sends out a very positive message and engages with lots of volunteers providing excellent value for money.

RECOMMENDED FUTURE WORK PROGRAMME

The Committee receives regular work programme updates at which Members have the opportunity to consider items for inclusion on the work programme, and suggest any new issues that may be of interest to the Committee. The following items have been identified during 2019/20 as suitable items for discussion during the 2020/21 work programming process:

- Cardiff's Bus Routes & Services;
- Lamby Way Solar Farm – Member Update;
- Highways Resurfacing Programme;
- Fourth Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report;
- Shared Regulatory Service Annual Report 2019/20 & Business Plan 2020/21;
- Recycling & Waste Management Strategy;
- Waste Collection Productivity;
- Recycling & Waste Management Service Restructure;
- Draft Budget Proposals 2021/22;
- Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate – Quarterly Performance;
- Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate – Directorate Delivery Plan 2020/21;
- Planning, Transport & Environment – Improving Digitalisation;
- Cabinet Response to Scrutiny report Managing Biodiversity;
- Transport for Wales – South Wales Metro Update;
- Transport White Paper.

Scrutiny Services, City and County of Cardiff,

Room 263, County Hall, Atlantic Wharf, Cardiff. CF10 4UW

Tel: 029 2087 2953 Email: scrutinyviewpoints@cardiff.gov.uk

© 2020 City and County of Cardiff